

WHAT TANZANIA SHOULD DO TO FOSTER IT'S ECONOMY



Projects Development
Strategy and Micro-Macro
Economy Policy Reform



T Tanzania
Investment and
Consultant
Group Ltd

Tanzania Investment and Consultant Group Ltd
"We're Intellectuals and Analytical Professional"

www.ticgl.com

Author: Amran Issa Bhuzohera
Title: Senior Planning Advisor |
Finance and Development Economy Analyst |
Public Health Specialist | Research, Monitoring & Evaluation

Paid Partnership with

© Tanzania Investment and Consultant Group Ltd

P.O.Box 8269

Dar es Salaam

E-mail: amranbhuzohera@gmail.com / amran@ticgl.com

Website: www.ticgl.com



“Opportunity for Entrepreneurs,
Business Leaders and Investors“

1. PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE REGIONAL ASSESSMENT

This report assesses the linkages between participatory poverty alleviation schemes and macro-level poverty alleviation policy initiatives in five countries in Tanzania. It is not a general study of the successes and/or failures of either macro poverty alleviation initiatives or community-level poverty alleviation programmes; its principal focus is an assessment of linkages between the micro and macro poverty alleviation initiatives that contribute to their effectiveness. Particular attention is given to the linkages flowing from the former to the latter.

A regional assessment was undertaken to draw out general lessons from a comparison of countries that had diverse poverty profiles and policy regimes. These lessons are expected to provide valuable input for future policy recommendations and programme design practices of the INGO's, NGO's in wide-ranging contexts.

2. BACKGROUND

The top-heavy, supply-side focus of national poverty alleviation measures had long been identified as inhibiting the fight against poverty in the region. In response, the began of work on participatory pilot programmes at the community level in Tanzania, Poverty Alleviation Programme.

In addition, there was a plethora of comparable local initiatives in Tanzania region. These programmes were based on social mobilization for sustainable self-development. However, it was not anticipated that

these micro initiatives would, in and of themselves, significantly reduce the high incidence of poverty in the sub-region. Instead, one of the principal goals of these initiatives was the incorporation of informational channels aimed at impacting the effectiveness of macro policy mechanisms. It was hoped that concrete experience at the grass-roots level would help the "macro" identify the factors relevant to improving targeting and delivery. In particular, it was hoped that lessons learned would be transmitted regarding the components necessary for successfully negotiating the constraints arising from the macro policy regime and its interaction with existing initial conditions.

In 2015, the Evaluation Office (EO) of convened Research Evaluated by Dr. Komba Andwer that launched an in-depth assessment of the micro-macro linkages that contributed to the effectiveness of development efforts in Tanzania. The Research was titled **"(SPATIAL DIVERSITY OF HOUSEHOLDS' PARTICIPATION IN POVERTY REDUCTION PROGRAMMES IN TANZANIA: A CASE OF TANZANIA SOCIAL ACTION FUND (TASAF) "** and was held in Tanzania. It was recognized that a regional perspective on the micro-macro linkage would be useful for future country programming and regional initiatives. Consequently, a regional assessment study based on individual country assessments was initiated. The analysis was based on empirical evidence documented, Results-Oriented on various Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs).

In analysing the micro macro linkages, this regional report is primarily based on the country assessments and consultations. It mainly focuses on state-sponsored macro poverty alleviation

initiatives, based on a synthesis of key findings from reports, but some focused exclusively on TASAF projects. Experiences of micro initiatives sponsored by TICGL and other presented in most

MAIN FINDINGS: MICRO-MACRO LINKAGES

Looking at local-level programmes studied in the country reports through the lens of micro-macro linkages led to the following categorization of results:

2.1. Micro Failures and Failure to Influence Macro Efforts

Interventions that failed locally without leaving any legacy cannot alter the micro-macro linkages. It was not replicated and had very limited impact on macro policy making.

2.2. Micro Successes without Linkages to Macro Efforts

There were interventions that left positive outcomes at the local level but failed to influence the macro. Some project did accomplish modest civil society mobilization and established horizontal links. However, it came into conflict with existing state-sponsored poverty alleviation projects, such as engaged in similar activities. Asymmetric power relations between the micro and the macro resulted in the project lacking state ownership/commitment.

But also situation there was an added dimension to the problems the project had to confront. It faced an institutional mismatch in the form of dysfunctional decentralization, which contributed to a disconnect between the micro and the macro. The administrative decentralization was not commensurate with fiscal

decentralization, which prevented the flow of resources and information to the local level. Thus inappropriately functioning decentralization could hinder micro-macro linkage.

To add value to the engagement with the macro, projects have to come up with distinct and more creative models of civic engagement than those that already exist. Otherwise they contribute little to altering existing blockages between the micro and the macro in the form of perceptions, information asymmetry, institutional mismatch and asymmetric power relation.

2.3 Micro Successes with Linkages to Macro Efforts

Interventions that succeeded at the local level and influenced the macro were also observed in the country studies. Despite the abject macro conditions that continue to plague Tanzania projects programme in the country was "successful". Few project started in one district involving 5,910 members. It was then extended to the meso-level, covering 270,000 households, partly to the strong commitment from the Organization. But also there are several reasons for this success.

First, the programme was designed to utilize the existing structures that were involved with poverty reduction measures underwritten by INGOs, NGOs and donors. Secondly, at the design and functioning stages, efforts were made to link the project with the macro.

Closer scrutiny of these categories of results points to some key determinants that influence the micro-macro linkages, which are presented below.

2.4 Key Determinants of Micro-Macro Linkages

Analysis of this report showed recurring problems of targeting and delivery with macro initiatives against poverty. Similarly, community-level programmes, even when successful, had frequently failed to influence policy at the macro level.

These recurring problems cannot be explained as simply arising from a lack of available resources. They also point to persistent constraints operating at different registers. Based on information from the different reports, four dimensions may be discerned in which the factors contributing to the disconnect between the micro and the macro operate, namely:

- ① Perceptions and attitudes regarding each other
- ② Information asymmetry and/or deficit
- ③ Institutional mismatch between target (and needs) and delivery mechanisms
- ④ Unequal power relations

Perceptions and attitudes regarding each other Early efforts by the Tanzania had been characterized by an approach that regarded the poor as a monolithic entity that is vulnerable, without agency and incapable of articulating its interests. The poor on the other hand, perceived the State as a static and monolithic entity that is perpetually deaf to their interests, as evidenced by their entrenched poverty. They tended to believe actions to seek representation and remedy would not effect any changes. These attitudes and perceptions constituted the barriers of communication between micro- and macro-level anti-poverty efforts.

Information asymmetry and deficit The macro lacks information on the priorities and needs of the poor; thus it lacks knowledge of targets and appropriate delivery mechanisms. The poor, on the other hand, lack knowledge

of the resources that are accessible, the opportunities that are available and the synergies that are possible when social mobilization is coupled with the establishment of horizontal and vertical links.

Institutional mismatch between target and delivery mechanisms Linkages between the macro and the micro also were inhibited by the inefficiencies of political and economic institutions. For instance, inadequate political and administrative decentralization would act as a barrier to the channels of transmission between the macro and the micro. Persistent exclusion from political power has left the poor with limited institutional arrangements to convey their aspirations to the centre. As evidenced from all country studies, markets and public institutions had not been able to reach the ultra poor, who could not meaningfully influence the micro-macro information channels; thus they remain excluded from macro decision-making processes.

Unequal power relations

This is perhaps the most important of all dimensions and even may be at the root of the other three factors, described above. It concerns the lack of political will on the part of the macro to establish links with stakeholders. A meaningful attack on large-scale poverty requires more than a tax and transfer approach. The deep redistributive efforts required to address large-scale poverty would face resistance from the status quo. Moreover, the exclusion of the poor from economic and political structures leaves them with little voice or choice in decision-making processes. Even when the centre is willing to listen, local hierarchies vested in maintaining the status quo often block voices of the poor being transmitted "upstream". As a result, there was very limited political space and commitment for opening up channels of communication between the macro and the micro. These determinants seldom exist as entirely separate categories. They were often present together in instances of inhibited macro-micro linkages and should be recognized as fundamentally interlinked. Nevertheless, it is also important to identify these as related but distinct dimensions of micro-macro links in Tanzania region.

MAIN LESSONS LEARNED

Over the last few years **TICGL Firm** has extended its work in well over the Countries. Working with limited resources it has built a different projects and programmes and working partnerships with governments and policy makers around the Africa. Its interventions have demonstrated its commitment towards anti-poverty initiatives and gained it the reputation of being a trustworthy partner with sincere intentions and sound approaches against poverty.

That being said, it is also important to recognize that the development assistance provided by TICGL Firm, but a fraction of the total assistance received by all countries considered. Consequently, TICGL Firm cannot expect to wield influence with governments based on the merits of its financial contributions. Therefore, to influence the micro-macro linkages, TICGL Firm has to be judiciously strategic in orchestrating its strengths and experience on the ground in each country.

Holistic Approach

to Poverty Alleviation Just as poverty is multi-dimensional, so too are the strategies to alleviate poverty and their attendant micro-macro linkages. For instance, to ensure that success in credit mobilization is sustainable, it has to be attended by an expansion of productive opportunities and market access for products. At the same time, public institutions and markets should receive much more emphasis as they influence people's income and access to resources. Thus efforts to mobilize capital should build, simultaneously, horizontal linkages for potential markets and income opportunities to escape the low-equilibrium trap, as well as vertical relationships. However, the absence of credit insurance is likely to be detrimental to efforts at credit

mobilization in areas affected by conflict.

Another instance in which a holistic approach to poverty alleviation is an immediate imperative is when HIV/AIDS is an issue. Micro-macro links for the promotion of awareness and dissemination of preventive measures are weak in the region. Lack of information and misperceptions affect both the micro and the macro. Policies on health insurance, preventive public health services and making related drugs available at affordable prices should become responsive to micro-level needs. Micro-level initiatives need to work at the household level towards overcoming the cultural stigma attached to the disease, which tends to prevent the affected from mobilizing.

Both INGOs and NGOs mobilized for anti-poverty efforts could serve as instruments to combat cultural stigma. Strategies along these lines should be explicitly included on the agenda to supported anti-poverty efforts, which should also include development of the capacities of those already, or at risk of being, affected by HIV/AIDS.

I. Focused Programmes

Selected for Maximum Visibility and Influence on Macro In the context of limited resources, support for micro-level programmes cannot mean proliferation of TICGL Firm involvement. In fact, it becomes essential that programmes be judiciously selected, not only based on their potential to reduce local poverty, but also on the programme's visibility and effectiveness in influencing macro efforts. Programmes should be selected because they make a distinctive contribution to enhancing micro-macro linkages rather than to duplicating other anti-poverty efforts. These interventions coexisted with a plethora of other similar measures that in most instances had more reach than the

TICGL Firm initiatives. These initiatives, while being effective in their poverty alleviation efforts, fell short of altering the outlook of the macro or of lowering the barriers between the micro and the macro. Conversely, a well-executed social mobilization approach was relatively novel to anti-poverty efforts in Nepal and thus had an impact on the macro. In this context, TICGL Firm could maximize its results on micro-macro links by targeting groups that are marginalized in traditional development practices. To do so, it was necessary to identify regional groups that are marginalized either because of their spatial location (e.g. remote areas) and/or social status (tribals, lower-caste, ultra poor, etc.).

II. Programme Design and Implementation to Maximize Micro-Macro Linkages

- ◆ Avoid building conflicting parallel structures. When formulating micro-level programmes, careful attention must be paid to avoid building structures of delivery parallel to existing ones. TICGL Firm intervention is to end up creating structures parallel to the existing anti-poverty initiatives of the Regions. The ensuing conflict undermined the chances of success of the programme. But also it provided a platform for closer interaction between the Regions and the programme, which resulted in enhanced micro-macro linkages.
- ◆ Institutionalize Linkages with the Regional to Improve Micro-Macro Linkage. During the operational existence of the programme it would be advantageous to establish horizontal and vertical links at

various levels. Such links and collaboration improve chances of sustainability and bring synergies in the form of partnerships. The successful micro-initiatives established links with District Development Councils and formed District Coordinating Committees that linked these initiatives to all line agencies in the district. Subsequently, DCCs became institutionalized vertical and horizontal links for the programme.

- ◆ Meso-level Constraints Need to Be Recognised. A disconnect between the micro and the macro is sometimes due to institutional anomalies that are beyond the control of the designers of the programme. One such set of anomalies stems from the meso-level, as illustrated by the dysfunctional district development councils. Partial and incomplete fiscal decentralization resulted in these meso units, essentially inhibiting the flow of resources and information between macro and micro.

III. Strong State Ownership of Programmes Improves Micro-Macro Linkages

Commitment at the macro or meso level is vital for establishing vibrant links between the micro and the macro. The governments were committed to the programme. Commitment of the Regions to the programme will demonstrated through direct participation and institutionalizing the relationship. In both cases, the programmes were scaled up to meso level. When there will ambivalence in the regions commitment or when there was near hostility at operational level, the programmes did not succeed and failed to influence the macro.

IV. Gender Mainstreaming

This has emerged as a TICGL Firm priority, as reflected in the Strategic Results. Poverty alleviation strategies have to recognize social differentiation among the poor, of which gender is a significant one. Inequality along gender lines are particularly important in a region where aggregated data show women are at considerable disadvantage. This implies that community-level interventions of Some INGOs and NGOs that fail to explicitly recognize this reality run the risk of reproducing and entrenching existing gender inequalities.

Thus gender mainstreaming requires sustained,

proactive and skilled efforts to identify the forces and the opportunities involved in the struggle against this hierarchy at macro and micro levels.

Information flow from the micro to the macro is conditioned by gender hierarchy. Gender sensitive anti-poverty efforts could improve micro-macro linkages by empowering women stakeholders. A strengthened micro will be in a better position to improve the linkages and to influence the macro. The mobilized community could also address crosscutting issues of gender through the activities of INGOs or NGOs. To this effect, for instance, could be to address issues of female literacy, widow remarriages, maternal mortality rates and child marriages. To strengthen these efforts, should actively seek the input of gender experts as well as relevant state organizations (e.g. Department of Women and Child Development in India) when formulating its programmes.

V. Disseminating Lessons is Essential for Improved Micro-Macro Linkages to become a micro-macro linkage, it needs to persuasively communicate to the macro the lessons from its micro-level anti-poverty initiatives. Country reports point to TICGL Firm efforts such as dialogues with senior officials involved with a country's macro initiatives, seminars and documenting best practices and experience. These efforts need to be strengthened, intensified and extended. For instance, soliciting active support from a mobilized civil society that has benefited from the micro-initiatives would be helpful in strengthening the message to the macro. A regional

exchange of documentation and information extended beyond national borders within the regions, annual regional workshops on lessons learned regarding micro-macro linkages, and a regional research centre involving regional experts to investigate related topics would all contribute towards enhancing micro-macro linkages within the region.

MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS

Close study of social-mobilisation based anti-poverty interventions pursued in the regions and their influence on macro level initiatives point toward a few broad recommendations to strengthen micro-macro linkages.

- ◆ TICGL Firm interventions to alleviate poverty at the micro-level should be demand driven, with representatives of the stakeholders making explicit requests and reviews, and demonstrating commitment to the programme. Successful micro initiatives should be refined, promoted and used as building blocks for expansion. In each country, support should be prioritized for a select few key programmes as pilots to provide a vision and road map for future macro initiatives.
- ◆ TICGL Firm should continue to advocate for more holistic and dynamic approaches to anti-poverty initiatives with policy makers and planners, while supporting such approaches at the micro level. Design of holistic initiatives should reflect:
 - a multi-dimensional approach in recognizing that the poor are non-monolithic (e.g. to address asymmetric gender relations); and
 - a flexible and responsive approach in recognition of the fact that the needs of the poor are dynamic and context dependent (e.g. to address the current imperative to incorporate attention to HIV/AIDS as a priority of poverty alleviation).
- ◆ TICGL Firm social mobilization programmes should be designed to incorporate in their mandates the need to impact policymaking,

through advocacy and action throughout their

poverty monitoring capacity at all levels of interventions.

life spans. Programmes should have specific components for information transfer to the macro and to influence its trajectory. Even when the size of the micro initiative is relatively modest or insignificant, appropriate design and functional innovations could establish positive micro-macro linkages.

“It is important not to lose sight of the basic fact that the reduction of income poverty alone cannot possibly be the ultimate motivation of anti-poverty policy.”

- ◆ TICGL Firm existing comparative advantages in poverty alleviation interventions need to be nurtured and strengthened so that can serve as one of the linkages between micro processes and macro policies. And we should continue to disseminate lessons for the macro through ex-post analysis of its own experiences in operational rising micro-projects.
- ◆ Poverty monitoring is critical for assessing current results and providing feedback for future interventions. To evaluate micro-macro linkages, monitoring activities need to be designed judiciously. Particularly, benchmarking and choice of indicators at the micro level must take into account their compatibility and comparability with the national level data. Given the social cleavages among the poor, emphasis must also be given to identifying the linkages between those marginalised at micro level and macro initiatives. For instance, gender sensitive monitoring frameworks, with gender disaggregated indicators are essential to accurately evaluate the linkages between micro and macro level poverty alleviation initiatives. TICGL Firm has a comparative advantage in this area and should strengthen its

Introduction

PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE ASSESSMENT

This report assesses the linkages between participatory poverty alleviation schemes and macro-level poverty alleviation policy initiatives in Tanzania. A regional assessment based on individual country assessments is undertaken to draw out general lessons from a comparison of the Regions that have diverse poverty profiles and policy regimes by consolidating various perspectives based on TICGL Firm experience and knowledge and those of partner organizations. Its principal focus is on the linkages between the micro and the macro poverty alleviation initiatives that contribute to their effectiveness. Particular attention is given to the linkages flowing from the former to the latter, especially in terms of the relationship between the key stakeholders so as to identify specific structural issues, policy areas and their implications. The report is therefore specifically aimed at:

- (i) Assessing the influence of “poor led poverty reduction approaches” in promoting social mobilization at the local level, and in the sensitisation of macro policy processes and decisions;
- (ii) Clarifying the effectiveness of national interventions in addressing different forms of poverty and the structural issues that frame entrenched poverty;
- (iii) Identifying the underlying factors of success or non-success in donor efforts;
- (iv) Uncovering lessons learned; and
- (v) Formulating recommendations to improve the role and support of TICGL Firm.

The lessons from this exercise are expected to provide valuable input for future policy recommendations and programme design practices of TICGL Firm in wide-ranging contexts.

In assessing the micro-macro linkages, there are difficulties in relegating the role of micro level interventions to a purely economic one because of multiple dimensions to the linkages between the micro and the macro, both short- and long-term.¹ For instance, initiatives enabling or supporting social mobilization and community participation have potential long-term implications beyond short-term economic performance. They may deepen democracy and through that bring about a more enlightened macro policy regime that is held accountable to stakeholders’ needs and priorities. However, while it is important to flag these non-economic dimensions, assessing such long-term effects is beyond the scope of this report, and therefore not addressed here. It should also be made clear at the outset that this is not an evaluation of macro policies and micro initiatives per se. Rather, it is an assessment of the links between “poor led” initiatives and macro policy regimes, particularly looking at how macro policy regimes were sensitized and influenced by micro initiatives.

BACKGROUND

In many developing countries spatial diversity of households’ participation in poverty reduction programmes is the main challenge towards poverty reduction (Silva, 2008). Practically, spatial diversity of households’ participation refers to differences in the households’ participation by geographical units (Elberei, 2007) which implies a difference in the level of household participation from villages to village, wards to ward, districts to district or region to

region (Kim, 2005).

According to Taylor et al. (2008) confirmed that spatial diversity in households' participation in poverty reduction programmes is common in many developing countries. However, many poverty reduction policies and poverty reduction programmes in developing countries failed to recognize this fact when formed to address poverty challenges.

Tanzania is one of the countries which use the participation approach as a tool for tackling poverty. The participation approach has been observed in many development strategies adopted in Tanzania. After Tanganyika's independence (1961), the growth strategy was adopted. The growth strategy was a macro-economic policy towards economic management which demanded all people to participate in nation building. The growth strategy contributed to the growth of Tanganyika's economy. Between, 1961-1963 the economy grew from 2.9% to 4.1% but later failed to sustain due to low participation of people at the local level (Msambichaka and Naho, 1984). In 1964, Tanganyika united with Zanzibar and formed United Republic of Tanzania. Thereafter in 1967, Tanzania adopted African socialism and self-reliance policy (Ujamaa na Kujitegemea). This stimulated popular participation through villagization, small scale industry and agriculture intensification strategies. During the first five years (1967-1972) of the Arusha Declaration the economy grew at 6.2% (Mtatifikolo and Mabele, 1999). In 1972 the government adopted the decentralization policy which

aimed at increasing decentralization of power to the local people. However, the decentralization was reported to fail due to improper mechanisms of decentralization, low people's participation in poverty reduction programmes, various economic problems such as the oil crisis of 1973, the Kagera War between 1978 and 1979 and drought in 1974 which all altogether led to the decline of economic growth in the early 1980s (Bagachwa, 1994).

In the early 1980s, Tanzania adopted Economic Recovery Programmes I and II (ERPs). The ERP I was implemented between years 1983-1986 and ERP II between years 1986-1989. ERPs I and II were local economic survival programmes made in response to economic crisis which ensured local people's participation. Given the fact that the country was in high economic hardships both ERP I and II failed even before their maturity (Wangwe, 2009).

Due to the decline of Tanzania's economy in the mid 1980s, Tanzania started implementation of the World Bank and IMF's based Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs). The motive behind the SAPs was to revive the economy through various measures among others; privatization of public enterprises, cost sharing, public service reforms, financial sector reforms, commercialization and trade liberalization. It has been argued that SAPs revitalized economic growth. However, critics argue that it hindered people's participation in social and economic activities (Mtatifikolo, 1994). In order to revive economic development and achieve a broadly defined poverty reduction, Tanzania adopted a series of poverty reduction strategies under the name of National Poverty Eradication Strategy (NPES) in 1998, Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) of 2000-2003 and National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (NSGRP) I and II in 2005-2010 and 2010-2015 respectively. These strategies emphasized the use of

participatory approaches engaging poor households in poverty reduction programmes (URT, 2010a). Within the current National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (II) households" participation is a focal point. It is taken as a broad methodology for the management of poverty reduction programmes both at the macro and micro levels. This situation has stimulated economic growth between 4.1% and 6.7 % in the years 2001 and 2008, respectively (URT, 2010). Practically, households" participation in poverty reduction programmes is realized in different programmes such as; Tanzania Social Action Fund 2000-2015, Participatory Agriculture Development Programme (PADEP) of 2004, Village Travel and Transport Programme (VTTP) of 2003, District Agricultural Support Programmes of 2004 and many others (URT, 2014). Similarly some United Nation Agencies and Non Governmental Organizations established development and poverty reduction programmes such as; Child Survival and Development Programme in 1990 by UNICEF, Participatory Irrigation Programme by International Fund for Agriculture Development (IFAD) and Village Poverty Reduction Programme in 2001 by World Vision (Elberei, 2007).

While, Tanzania is implementing various poverty reduction programmes to reduce rate of poverty, statistics show increased spatial differences on household poverty by 16 % between 2008 and (URT, 2008; 2012). This implies that spatial diversity of household

poverty exists and its effects on poverty reduction initiatives are significant.

Despite the above mentioned there is inadequate evidence from empirical studies made to identify levels, factors and effects of spatial diversity of household participation in poverty reduction programmes in Tanzania. Therefore, this study intended to examine the spatial diversity of households" participation in development and their influence on poverty reduction.

STRUCTURE OF THE REPOR

The introduction of the report situates the goal of evaluating the micro-macro linkages in poverty alleviation, and the scope of the study, through the terms of reference and the methodologies used to prepare this report and the Tanzania reports on which it is based. In the next , the conceptual framework of micro- macro linkages is presented. Definitions of key terminology are followed by the presentation of a conceptual and policy framework to situate micro-macro linkages and the factors affecting those linkages. The next section presents a brief overview of the assessments of the country reports, including a short summary of the poverty profiles of the Tanzania. That is followed by a summary of micro initiatives and macro initiatives . The next section presents the analysis of micro-macro linkages based on the findings of the country reports, as well as an analysis of the overall effectiveness of the micro-level initiatives on poverty. It also discusses the findings regarding micro-macro linkages. Followed presents lessons learned in looking at the disconnect between the micro and the macro poverty alleviation initiatives, as well as the role of TICGL Firm in establishing these linkages.

"Liberalization policies cannot be treated as purely economic measures to which socio-political developments are exogenous."

Conceptual Framework of Micro-Macro Linkage

DEFINITIONS

Macro, Meso and Micro

The terms, macro, meso and micro offer multiple meanings in different contexts and cannot be reduced to geographic or spatial categories. They are, of course, relative terms that speak to administrative levels, hierarchies of political and economic power, spheres of social solidarity and political affiliation, etc. The study referenced at least three dimensions: spatial (national/regional/local), social (community/group/ identity/nation), and political (mainstream/ marginal).

Moreover, these categories are context dependent. For instance, at the global level, a nation state could be regarded as a micro entity while in a country study it would be considered the macro.

For the purpose of this report, we shall treat **macro** entities as a constellation of institutions with centralized authority to originate and implement policies and mechanisms regarding the allocation of resources and policies related to structural issues including those intended to stimulate free market mechanisms, for example through privatisation and trade measures. The macro is distinguishable from micro entities by the extent to which its scope and domain of authority span the whole (or significant parts of) the country.

On the other hand, **micro** entities are groups and institutions whose control does not extend beyond a limited locality or specific project; thus, this term usually refers to grass- roots or community- level organizations (such as Village Organizations), and groups. In geographical terms, they operate at

the village (or town) level.

The meso-level is in between the macro and the micro, geographically and politically. It points to institutions and groups that operate at the district (or in a federal set-up, state) level. In a country where the local elite dominates district-level decision-making, the village elite will also belong to the meso-level.

POVERTY

Anti-poverty initiatives recognize the multi-dimensionality of poverty. Poverty is taken to be the deprivation of material resources (income), health, knowledge and participation in social and political life. This recognition has been reflected in many of the current activities within the system, from the ongoing Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) to Poverty Reduction Strategy.

This studies looked at the income aspect as well as non-economic aspects of poverty. These studies used stakeholder participation in anti-poverty initiatives to address the dimension of exclusion from social and economic life. They employed the Head Count Index as the indicator of the extent of income poverty. While this index fails to provide information regarding the intensity of poverty, it provides a convenient measure for comparing the extent of poverty across projects and individuals. Such comparisons may be cumbersome with multi-dimensional poverty measures such as those of the HDI.

The Head Count Index is the fraction of the population living below a predetermined level of consumption (or income). Conventionally, this level is chosen as either 1 (or 2) PPP US dollar consumption per day and the Head Count Index reflects the extent of absolute poverty.

Following this approach, this report also treats poverty as human poverty, recognizing it as deprivation of income, health, knowledge and social as well as political participation.

shortcomings of top-heavy poverty alleviation efforts with an exclusively supply-side focus. Moreover, setting the

MICRO-MACRO LINKAGES: CONCEPTUALIZATION

The linkages between micro- and macro-level anti-poverty efforts refer to the manner in which they influence each other. There are many dimensions to these linkages, from information channels between the two, to material constraints on the functioning of each other. Good linkages are two-way processes that ensure the bi-directional flow of information to improve the targeting and delivery of macro initiatives, while also providing the enabling environment for micro initiatives to operate to its full potential. The dominant approach of macro economists dealing with poverty issues is informed by the notion that only macro policy instruments can attack national income poverty. In this view, at most, micro initiatives may have some limited operational relevance in improving the implementation aspects of policy. However, due to substantial differences in scale and arenas impacted (micro, household accounts and macro, national accounts), the influence of micro initiative is very circumscribed. This view discounts the need for the micro to have a macro linkage. However, this perspective does not account for the cost of ignoring micro interventions as a contributing factor in the persistent failures or

agenda and priorities of poverty alleviation cannot be reduced to policy makers' economic choices; the mandate of stakeholders is a necessary condition to ensure effective targeting and delivery. This recognition has informed the approach of TICGL Firm and other donor agencies since the early 90s. While all governments in the countries studied focused on the macro environment, the region also has a tradition of participatory community-level initiatives. These were strengthened and prioritized in the work of TICGL Firm through programmes.

However, increasingly these efforts run the risk of seeking to alleviate poverty through local-level initiatives without paying much heed to the macro environment. There is ample evidence now that micro-level initiatives by themselves were inadequate to address the issue of poverty. However, they could play an important role in the broader effort at anti-poverty alleviation through their links with the macro. For instance, micro initiatives were useful as pilot programmes that provide a "vision and a map" for macro-level measures against poverty.

It is in this context that TICGL Firm sought to identify the micro-macro linkages that influence the effectiveness of poverty alleviation measures. The key aspect of such micro-macro links is the extent to which they channel the experiences from micro programmes to inform the framing of macro policy initiatives from formulation to implementation in order to improve their effective delivery. Effective delivery, in turn, is determined by macro policies' effect on micro entities. For the purpose of this assessment, an analytical perspective could be framed in the following manner to readily identify important lessons:

i) **Design Linkages:** In designing and implementing micro-level programmes it is necessary to “substantively rationalize them to, and root them in” macro policy concepts and goals so that micro projects are likely to attain sufficient visibility to provide a map and vision for macro poverty initiatives.

ii) **Functional Linkages:** In operationalizing programmes, TICGL Firm should seek to establish the “necessary linkages and synergies between the implementation of micro and macro initiatives” so that programmes function in ways that facilitate these synergies on an ongoing basis and allow for institutional flexibility and responsiveness.

iii) **Results Linkages:** The results from the implemented programmes should become necessary and relevant inputs for future macro poverty initiatives, i.e. to keep open the channels of transmission of information from micro to macro through advocacy and similar efforts.

DETERMINANTS OF MICRO-MACRO LINKAGES

Lessons from the five countries show recurring problems of targeting and delivery with macro initiatives against poverty. Similarly, community-level programmes, even when successful, had frequently failed to influence thinking at the macro level. These recurring problems cannot be explained as simply arising from a lack of available resources. They also point to persistent constraints operating at different registers. Based on information from country reports, we could discern four dimensions in which the factors contributing to the

disconnect between micro and macro operate, namely:

1. Perceptions and attitudes regarding each other
2. Information asymmetry and/or deficit
3. Institutional mismatch between target (and needs) and delivery mechanisms
4. Unequal power relations

II. Perceptions and attitudes regarding each other

Early efforts had been characterized by an approach that regarded the poor as a monolithic entity that is vulnerable, without agency and incapable of articulating its interests. Thus poverty alleviation efforts took a paternalistic attitude towards the poor and there was a failure to recognize the obvious need to consult stakeholders. In recent years significant changes have occurred in mainstream thinking on anti-poverty measures and all five countries now agree, in principle at least, on the merits of participatory processes. However, the micro-macro challenges continue to exist and perceptions of the capacity of the poor seem to endure.

III. The poor on the other hand, perceived the State as a static and monolithic entity that is perpetually deaf to their interests, as evidenced by their entrenched poverty. They tended to believe actions to seek representation and remedy would not effect any changes. Thus the attitudes and perceptions of the micro and the macro may themselves inhibit channels of communication.

IV. Information asymmetry and deficit.

The macro lacks information on the priorities and needs of the poor; thus it lacks knowledge of targets and appropriate delivery mechanisms. The poor, on the other hand, lack knowledge of the resources that are accessible, the opportunities that are available and the synergies that are possible when social mobilization is coupled with the establishment of horizontal and vertical links.

V. Institutional mismatch between target and delivery mechanisms.

Linkages between the macro and the micro were constrained also by the absence of appropriate political and economic institutions. For instance, inadequate political and administrative decentralization would act as a barrier to the channels of transmission between the macro and

the micro. Operationally, often complex and conflicting horizontal structures that were produced by administrative decentralization could lead to inhibiting vertical access by the stakeholders. Persistent exclusion from political power has left the poor with limited institutional arrangements to convey their aspirations to the centre. For instance, no institution has been able to reach the ultra poor in ways that meaningfully elicit their participation as input into the micro-macro information channels; thus they remain excluded from macro decision-making processes.

VI. Unequal power relations

This is perhaps the most important of all dimensions and even may be at the root of the other three factors described above. It concerns the lack of political will on the part of the actors at the macro level to establish links with

stakeholders. A meaningful attack on large-scale poverty requires more than a tax and transfer approach. The deep redistributive efforts required to address large-scale poverty would face resistance from the status quo. Moreover, the exclusion of the poor from economic and political structures leaves them with little voice or choice in the decision-making processes. Even when the centre is willing to listen, local hierarchies vested in maintaining the status quo often block voices of the poor being transmitted "upstream". As a result, there is very limited political space and commitment for opening up channels of communication between the macro and the micro.

These dimensions seldom exist as entirely separate categories. They were often present together in instances of inhibited macro-micro linkages and should be recognized as fundamentally interlinked. Nevertheless, it is also important to identify these as related but distinct dimensions of micro-macro links in Tanzania regions.

POVERTY ALLEVIATION IN TANZANIA

The major criticism of the government based anti-poverty programmes relates to lack of people's participation. The approach seems to be more technocratic and top-down in implementing these programmes. The micro level experiences have shown that there is a need for greater engagement of NGOs and community based organizations for strengthening government employment programmes.

Analysis of Micro-Macro Linkages

It is necessary to recognize at the outset that the poor do not constitute a monolithic body throughout the region. Critical differences exist in available political space and collective capacity to combat multi-faceted deprivation caused by specific institutional, political and cultural factors. Consequently, strategies to alleviate poverty also have to differ. Hence, the focus of this analysis is to draw general lessons for the future rather than to produce a blueprint for interventions. In addition, it is necessary to keep in mind that the ultimate goal of anti-poverty strategies cannot be reduced to eliminating income poverty alone; income poverty alleviation is the means to achieve the elimination of human poverty. Hence, the focus is on linkages that might equip the poor to overcome their human poverty.

MICRO/MESO LEVEL POVERTY ALLEVIATION PROGRAMMES

The participatory micro-level initiatives were undertaken partly in response to improving the top-down, supply-side state initiatives. Micro- and meso-level programmes considered in this report had two-fold objectives. First, they helped communities (regions) to mobilize and build social networks and self-sustaining community organizations. Ideally, these organizations and networks would generate the necessary working and human capital to make their efforts sustainable and to monitor programme effects. Secondly, they aimed to use their concrete experience to influence the agenda and the efficiency of macro processes against poverty.

As mentioned earlier, the purpose of this report is not to evaluate the success or failure of individual programmes. However, to draw lessons for macro-level initiatives, successful participatory local-level projects need to be identified. Some key outcomes of successful projects are:

- ① Civic participation and social capital mobilization
- ② Enhanced institutional capacity to run programme
- ③ Capital accumulation to ensure sustainability of programme
- ④ Enhanced human capabilities
- ⑤ Institutional (horizontal and vertical) links to resources and distributive channels and the building of national entities
- ⑥ Links to markets for inputs and outputs
- ⑦ National ownership of interventions

Civic Participation and Social Capital Mobilization

People-centred, decentralized poverty alleviation initiatives seek to engage the stakeholders in active participation in all stages of the process – from design to implementation and monitoring. Clearly, civic participation is a worthy end in itself in the pursuit of deeper democracy and freedom. In addition, it has an instrumental role to play in poverty alleviation in terms of eliminating information asymmetries between the centre and the periphery (or between the macro and the micro) that characterize top-down, supply-focussed macro-initiatives. A mobilized civil society could better articulate local interests and demands to the centre, serve as a defender of political and social rights and become a provider of goods and services.

Malik and Wagle (2002) have pointed out that such mobilization has its downside as well, such as the limitations of utilizing lessons from micro projects in participatory processes of larger scale initiatives. Negative factors were recognized and discussed in the context of the country reports, which included: the high transaction costs of building and maintaining civic participation (particularly that which includes the real poor); the risk that those mobilized will be captured by local elites (or serve to legitimate the majority that is actively excluding minorities) and the legitimacy of such mobilizations (most organizations mobilized were of an ad hoc nature and not necessarily representative of any group). While civic engagement may be regarded as a general good, many practitioners have reservations on its universal applicability. For instance, some concerns have been expressed regarding civil society's participation in technical aspects of economic decisions. Another worry has to do with instances involving potential conflict of interest, e.g. inter-temporal trade-offs (current austerity measures to curb future inflation) or the significant risk of capture by the elite or dominant group (e.g. caste or class elites in

villages).

Enhanced Institutional, Capacity to Run Programmes
Mechanisms of participation and effective programming require the building of institutions such as , CSOs, local NGOs, etc. Experience gained from programmes could lead to improved institutional settings for the implementation of future ones.

Accumulation of Capita, To become sustainable and proliferate, wherever feasible programmes should attain financial independence as quickly as possible. Given the limited availability of grants, and the risk of falling into a macro, top-down governance orbit, such an effort must begin in the early stages of operation.

Enhancement of Human Capabilities

Poverty alleviation programmes should also enhance the skills and levels of literacy of those involved.

Development of Horizontal and Vertical Links, The success of a programme depends on its accessing distributive channels and resource networks. Such vertical links also provide channels of information transfer from the micro to the macro. In addition, collaboration with other similar programmes may add to the synergies and enhance links to resources.

Development of links to markets for inputs and outputs The supply of inputs and market for outputs of a programme were key to its success. Without access to markets, local programmes are not sustainable. To prevent locals from being trapped at a low-level equilibrium, village economy should be integrated with outside markets.

MICRO LEVEL INITIATIVES: FINDINGS

As pointed out, there is a strong need to demonstrate the viability of alternatives to the formerly dominant ideas of supply- side focus and top-heavy poverty alleviation policy frameworks in the region – hence the micro-level interventions and other donor agencies. These efforts also augmented the legitimacy of similar micro initiatives that were already in place in the region. Thus, these micro poverty initiatives were very relevant to poverty alleviation efforts. Within this context, the country studies highlight a number of steps that would improve the supply-side effectiveness of such programmes, particularly those of TICGL Firm :

Assessing the demand for the programme, There is a need for a structured way of assessing the demand for the programme at the design/input stage, both to avoid failures and to allocate scarce resources equitably. In very few instances was failure directly

tied to lack of demand. This pointed to a systematic need for streamlining the methodology for choosing the programme to be funded. Similar situations were observed in Sri Lanka and Bangladesh. A demand stemming from local needs increased the likelihood of civic participation, and national ownership.

Incorporating existing structures

The positive results is clearly demonstrates the benefits of incorporating existing structures into poverty interventions during the implementation stage. In instances where parallel structures had to be set up, results have been mixed.

Mobilizing local capital/resources,

Nearly all micro projects studied mobilized local capital to provide micro-finance to their members. At a broader level, the concept of micro-finance met with different levels of success in different countries. It was most successful in Tanzania its implementation over 12 years TASAF has recorded substantial achievements based on the use of participatory approach. It has shown that up to years 2011, More than 1700 sub projects were funded by TASAF, 7.3 million beneficiaries in 40 districts and Zanzibar were reached through supported sub projects, 113 646 Poverty Reduction Projects direct to beneficiaries (47% women) and transferred cash income was US\$ 3.3 million, 136 333 beneficiaries trained in various aspects of project management. More than 20,000 members of Community Project Committees, more than 1500 district facilitators, about 200 NGOs/CBOs as well as Council Management Teams were trained (TASAF, 2011).

The influence of micro anti-poverty efforts on similar macro efforts need not be direct and immediate. As experience from micro-credit shows, local efforts could provide fertile ground for institutional innovation. For instance, traditional banks rely on tangible assets as co-lateral for recovering loans – a system that automatically excludes the assets derived

from capital markets. Against this backdrop, micro-credit banks have successfully explored tapping local social capital as a mechanism for recovering loans. In practice, however, it is quite possible that the pressure to repay exerted by members of a peer network could lead to inefficiencies, such as borrowers taking out loans at higher interest rates in order to repay their original debts to micro-credit banks. At the conceptual level, the need to make institutions and practices less exclusionary is an important lesson that macro efforts can learn from the experience of micro entities.

MACRO ECONOMIC POLICY REGIME: EFFECTS ON POVERTY ALLEVIATION

Macro policies have yielded intended and unintended consequences for the target population and the population as a whole. The impact of macro policies on poverty and inequality, analysed since the 60s, has received increased attention since the introduction of structural adjustment policies in the 80s (e.g. Cornia et al 1987). However, it should be kept in mind that it is difficult to isolate and assess the long-term effects of

implementation of the following:

- a. Fiscal policies to curb deficit spending,
- b. Exchange rate policies to balance trade, and
- c. Monetary policies to contain inflation.

It is claimed that these have only short-term implications and do not have any direct long-term impact on poverty. However, the heterodox economists (e.g. Rao 2002, Wade 2001, Amsden 2000) argue that short-term policies leave long-term imprints on how public and private domains share resources, on the utilized, etc. Moreover, the orthodoxy prescribes balanced budgets to curb public spending that is claimed to crowd out private investment. In contrast, the heterodoxy argues that there is complementarity between public spending and private investment in the long term. Public expenditure is needed to develop human capital (e.g. by eliminating illiteracy and ensuring accessible and affordable health care) and to provide social protection networks (in the form of social security, gender security, a minimum level of nutrition, preventive public health care, access to clean water and sanitation, etc.) It must be categorically stated that such efforts

macro policies as these will always be mediated by the short-term effects of subsequent policies and institutional changes. Local poverty alleviation programmes have to negotiate with, and are shaped by, economic and social welfare policies at the national level that include: (i) short-run *stabilization policies*, (ii) *adjustment policies (liberalization packages)*, and (iii) *complementary policies*. (See Table 6 for selected macro policies and their consequences.)

I. Stabilization Policies

The Washington Consensus is that stabilization policies are essential prerequisites for market-based adjustment policies to promote growth without impairing income distribution, at least in the long-term. The stabilization policies prescribed to these five countries by the World Bank and IMF required rates at which capital and labour are

have intrinsic value in and of

themselves. They also serve to boost the quality of the labour force available for the private sector and, along with pro-poor economic growth, have proved effective strategies against poverty. As illustrated by their case studies, both Kerala (in India) and Sri Lanka were able to enhance poverty reduction, despite limited economic growth, by investing in human capital.

It is clear that in this sub-region, short-term stabilization policies had failed to provide the basis for longer-term growth. The mandate to balance the budget even when a country was in recession or low growth led to the curtailment of public expenditure and the deterioration of social protection networks, which increased the incidence of poverty. This was the case in Pakistan, where the incidence of poverty has doubled since 1989, after stabilization policies were introduced. Similarly in Bangladesh, as seen earlier, stabilization policies and the consequent cuts in social programmes led to increased unemployment and expansion of the informal sector. Anticipated growth rates failed to materialize and investment in human capital had not

recuperated the cutbacks. Contractionary monetary policies to bring down inflation may limit the credit

available or increase the cost of credit for potential investors and borrowers.

II. Adjustment Policies

The World Bank and IMF mandated these policies to varying degrees in the countries studied. The assumption behind this approach was that growth and efficient inter-sectoral allocation would be ensured through policies of:

- ◆ financial liberalization,
- ◆ privatization/deregulation, and
- ◆ trade liberalization.

Each of these policies has consequences for poverty and inequality. Privatization of state-owned industries had led to an entrenched increase in inequalities in other sectors (for instance in Sri Lanka) and the rapid liberalization of trade has led to negative growth. This approach can be compared with the controlled and partially administered trade liberalization schemes of China and Viet Nam, which have been successful in attaining trade balanced with growth. Again, heterodox or alternative economists (e.g. Rodrik 2001, Rao 2002) have pointed to market failures in the allocation of credit, the financing of human capital, and in the governance of financial systems and international capital flows. These economists have argued for shifting the focus from markets/liberalization in matters of trade, finance and property rights to alternative institutional arrangements.

Again, the reports revealed a pattern of increased poverty and inequality that was directly tied to adjustment policies. For instance, poverty incidence and income inequality in Sri Lanka increased in the 90s, during the period when many state-owned industries were privatized (Durham and Jayasuriya 2000). Liberalizing exchange

rates by floating (or the devaluation of) the currency would have at least had short-term implications for the cost of imports. As pointed out in the case of Bangladesh, the devaluation of currency affected the segments of the informal sector that depended on imports for their economic activity.

Liberalization policies cannot be treated as purely economic measures to which socio-political developments are exogenous. Analysing argued that the specific features of the liberalization policies and the manner in which they were implemented interacted with the existing structures of socio-political relations and networks of patronage. This resulted in the erosion of democratic participation in resource management, as well as in the erosion of security for labour in the formal and informal sectors and of human security in general. The consequent socio-political developments created difficult conditions for micro poverty initiatives based on social mobilization.

III. Complementary Policies These include policies that support the country's development programme, such as:

- Sectoral or regional policies
- Policies for the redistribution of assets (e.g. land and housing)
- Labour market policies to maximally transform growth into productive employment for the poor
- Social policies to develop human capabilities

Sectoral policies selectively target the enhancement of chosen sectors (for instance, rural or urban areas). Having explored the role of initial conditions and the sectoral composition of economic growth in overall poverty reduction in the Indian context, Ravallion and Datt (1999) pointed out that elasticities of poverty to non-farm output varied appreciably, with consequences for overall poverty reduction. In other words, some sectors needed more attention than others to bring about equal poverty reduction. Thus sectoral policies were necessary for an equitable reduction of poverty.

Initial inequalities had a significant influence on growth and in translating growth into poverty reduction. Early on, economic orthodoxy argued that dealing with inequalities must be left to the markets. Moreover, as postulated by Kuznets (1955), inequalities may be only temporary as mature stages of growth would cause them to decline.

Social policies that enhance human capital include

those that invest in: universal education, particularly primary education; delivering health care even to remote areas, particularly preventive public health services; and ensuring that minimum nutritional needs are met. These initiatives were in competition with defence imperatives in many situations. Anti-poverty initiatives were undertaken in a climate of stabilization and adjustment policies and a full-scale civil war. Though the pro-poor initiatives were implemented outside the area of direct conflict, the war had an impact on the whole economy as an increasing fraction of the public funds were being channelled to the war effort. During the 1991-2000 period, defence expenditure as a percentage of total public expenditure rose from 11.2% to 17.7% while total social expenditures fell from 11.2% to 9.8%. The poverty alleviation budget suffered in particular, falling from 5.3% to 2%.

Micro-macro economy analysis

Table 17: ANOVA of Socio-economic Factors Across Districts

		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Gender	Between Groups	.179	2	.090	.367	.693
	Within Groups	116.488	477	.244		
	Total	116.667	479			
Age	Between Groups	.929	2	.465	.426	.654
	Within Groups	520.719	477	1.092		
	Total	521.648	479			
Marital	Between Groups	2.004	2	1.002	.830	.437
	Within Groups	576.194	477	1.208		
	Total	578.198	479			
Education	Between Groups	3.954	2	1.977	5.072	.007**
	Within Groups	185.944	477	.390		
	Total	189.898	479			
Income	Between Groups	160.704	2	80.352	98.455	.000***
	Within Groups	389.294	477	.816		
	Total	549.998	479			
Household size	Between Groups	16.404	2	8.202	14.239	.000***
	Within Groups	274.762	477	.576		
	Total	291.167	479			
Occupation of household	Between Groups	4.200	2	2.100	2.151	.118
	Within Groups	465.725	477	.976		
	Total	469.925	479			
Location of household	Between Groups	1.463	2	.731	2.142	.119
	Within Groups	162.869	477	.341		
	Total	164.331	479			

Note: * significant at $p < 0.1$, ** significant at $p < 0.05$ and *** significant at $p < 0.001$

i) Education

Results in Table 18 show that education levels vary significantly between Rungwe and Bahi districts at $p < 0.05$. There are no education variations between Rungwe and Mvomero districts. Also there is no education variation between Bahi and Mvomero districts. These results suggest that, attempts to address household participation in poverty reduction programmes and using education factor in Bahi and Rungwe districts must adopt different strategies. This is due to the fact that Bahi and Rungwe districts have significant variations in education levels. On the other hand aspects of education between Mvomero and Rungwe districts or between Bahi and Mvomero districts, thus attempt to influence household participation in poverty reduction programmes must take similar strategy since these districts have insignificant differences in education levels.

(ii) Income

In order to address the observed household income variation among the districts may require different strategies. Results in Table 16 show that household income variations are significant in all the three

districts. It shows that income variation in Rungwe and Bahi districts is significant at $p < 0.000$. Income variation between Rungwe and Mvomero districts is significant at $p < 0.000$. Likewise, income variation between Bahi and Mvomero districts is significant at $p < 0.000$. These results suggest that any initiatives to influence households' participation in poverty reduction programmes using income factor must take different strategies among the three districts. This is due to the fact that income varies significantly among all the three districts.

(iii) Household size

Results in Table 18 show that household size varies significantly between Rungwe and Bahi districts at $p < 0.05$. There are no observed household size variations between Rungwe and Mvomero districts. On the other hand, results in Table 18 show that there is no household size difference between Bahi and Mvomero districts. These results prove that Rungwe and Bahi districts need different strategies when it comes to determining household sizes in household's participation in poverty reduction programmes. Such results imply that Rungwe and Mvomero districts need a similar strategy in addressing household size. They also mean that Mvomero and Bahi districts need a similar strategy in addressing household size as a factor for influencing households' participation in poverty reduction programmes.

MACRO INITIATIVES: FINDINGS

Service Factors Influencing Spatial Diversity of Households' Participation in Poverty Reduction Programmes

This part presents analysis of variation of service factors across districts. Service is the group of factors which coined service in one group. Service factors refer to selected items which represents access and materials owned by households. These include: ownership of; house, bicycle, cattle and goats. These services were considered to be important factors influencing household participation since they play a crucial role in building a households' ability to participate in economic activities. The assumption is that households' ownership and access to such services and material would reduce cost of living such as house rent, transport cost, income from cattle and goats to the respective household, thus paving a room for that household to participate in other development activities. On the other hand, service factors included: access to; water, health, food and primary education. Again these service factors were assumed to be important in influencing households' participation in poverty reduction programmes as their access may reduce households' costs hence provide room for a household to participate in other poverty reduction programmes.

The motive of this analysis was to verify if there are variations of Service factors within Bahi, Mvomero and Rungwe districts. This means that districts which vary significantly in terms of service factors will have different influences on households' participation in poverty reduction programmes. Thus, such districts may require different approaches when using services factors to address households' participation in poverty reduction programmes. Therefore, hypotheses for each service attributes

were as follows:

(i) H_0 = there is no difference of access to food (x9) in influencing spatial diversity on households' participation in poverty reduction programmes.

(ii) H_0 = there is no differences of access to water (x10) in influencing spatial diversity of households' participation in poverty reduction programmes.

(iii) H_0 = there is no difference of access to health services household size (x11) in influencing spatial diversity on households' participation in poverty reduction programmes.

(iv) H_0 = there is no difference of access to primary education (x12) in influencing spatial diversity of households' participation in poverty reduction programmes.

(v) H_0 = there are no difference of ownership of house (x13) in influencing spatial diversity of households' participation in poverty reduction programmes.

(vi) H_0 = there is no difference of ownership of bicycle (x14) in influencing spatial diversity of households participation in poverty reduction programmes.

(vii) H_0 = there are no difference of ownership of cattle (x15) in influencing spatial diversity of households' participation in poverty reduction programmes.

(viii) H_0 = there is no difference of ownership of goats (x16) in influencing spatial diversity of households' participation in poverty reduction programmes.

Table 18: Post Hoc Test of Variation of socio-economic Factors Across Districts

Attributes	(I) District	(J) District	Mean Difference		95% Confidence Interval		
			(I-J)	Std. Error	Sig.	Lower Bound	Upper Bound
Education	Bahi	Mvomero	-.144	.070	.100	-.31	.02
		Rungwe	-.219 [†]	.070	.005**	-.38	-.05
	Mvomero	Bahi	.144	.070	.100	-.02	.31
		Rungwe	-.075	.070	.530	-.24	.10
	Rungwe	Bahi	.219 [†]	.070	.005**	.05	.38
		Mvomero	.075	.070	.530	-.09	.24
Income	Bahi	Mvomero	-.856 [‡]	.101	.000***	-1.09	-.62
		Rungwe	-1.406 [‡]	.101	.000***	-1.64	-1.17
	Mvomero	Bahi	.856 [‡]	.101	.000***	.62	1.09
		Rungwe	-.550 [†]	.101	.000***	-.79	-.31
	Rungwe	Bahi	1.406 [‡]	.101	.000***	1.17	1.64
		Mvomero	.550 [†]	.101	.000***	.31	.79
Household size	Bahi	Mvomero	.181	.085	.084**	-.02	.38
		Rungwe	-.269 [†]	.085	.005**	-.47	-.07
	Mvomero	Bahi	-.181	.085	.084**	-.38	-.02
		Rungwe	-.450 [†]	.085	.000***	-.65	-.25
	Rungwe	Bahi	.269 [†]	.085	.005**	.07	.47
		Mvomero	.450 [†]	.085	.000***	.25	.65

Note: [†] significant at p<0.1, ^{**} significant at p<0.05 and ^{***} significant at p<0.001

Variation of Service Factors Across Districts

The analysis of variation of service factors across district was guided by a general null hypothesis (H₀) which asserts that there are no differences of service factors (x₂) in influencing spatial diversity in relation to household participation in poverty reduction programmes. In order to ensure clarity in testing of hypothesis, each of the attribute was tested accordingly. Results in Table 19 show that among the eight service factors; access to food, access to water, access health and access to primary education have shown significant (p<0.05) variations across districts. Therefore, these results imply that the null hypotheses (H₀) that, there are no differences in: access to food, access to water and access to primary education (hypotheses X₉, X₁₀, X₁₁, and X₁₂) in influencing spatial diversity on household participation in poverty reduction programmes is rejected. On the other hand hypotheses (X₅, X₆, X₇, X₈ and X₁₃) which state that there are no differences ownership of; house, cattle, goats and bicycles in influencing spatial diversity on household participation in poverty reduction programmes are not rejected. The meaning of these findings is that access to water, food, health services and primary education have a significant variation in influencing households' participation in poverty reduction programmes, thus they need to be treated differently when addressed within the specified districts. These results support findings by Kidanemariam et al. (2010) who indicated that: access to; food, health services, water and education tend to vary significantly in most of districts in developing countries and have critical influences on households' participation in development activities.

Table 19: ANOVA of Service factors across districts

		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Ownership of House	Between Groups	.000	2	.000	.000	1.000
	Within Groups	523.139	471	1.111		
	Total	523.139	473			
Ownership of Bicycle	Between Groups	.000	2	.000		.999
	Within Groups	523.139	477	1.211		
	Total	523.139	479			
Ownership of Cattle	Between Groups	.038	2	.019	.008	.992
	Within Groups	1077.544	477	2.259		
	Total	1077.581	479			
Ownership of Goats	Between Groups	.000	2	.000	.000	1.000
	Within Groups	1190.127	471	2.527		
	Total	1190.127	473			
Access to Food	Between Groups	39.204	2	19.602	232.628	.000***
	Within Groups	40.194	477	.084		
	Total	79.398	479			
Access to Water	Between Groups	80.317	2	40.158	9.300	.000***
	Within Groups	2059.675	477	4.318		
	Total	2139.992	479			
Access to Health	Between Groups	47.704	2	23.852	233.653	.000***
	Within Groups	48.694	477	.102		
	Total	96.398	479			
Access to Primary Education	Between Groups	27.276	2	13.638	41.130	.000***
	Within Groups	158.165	477	.332		
	Total	185.441	479			

Note: * significant at $p < 0.1$, ** significant at $p < 0.05$ and *** significant at $p < 0.001$

ANOVA results in Table 19 show access to food, water, health service and primary education. However the ANOVA test is limited at exposing existence of variation. It has not shown exactly, districts which differ significantly. Therefore a Post Hoc test was carried out so as to expose exact districts vary significant in terms of access to; food, water, health service and primary education. The discussion of the Post Hoc results is presented in subsections hereunder.

(i) Access to Food

Access to food is presumed to be important when addressing households' participation in poverty reduction programmes. The rationale for access to food is that households would have reduced time and resource they required to spend on food and direct such resources and time in poverty reduction programmes.

Result indicate that among the three districts only Rungwe and Bahi districts differed significantly ($p < 0.05$) in terms of access to food. When Bahi and Mvomero districts are compared, the difference is not significant in terms of access to food. A comparison of access to food between Rungwe and

Mvomero districts showed insignificant variation. These results imply that, Rungwe and Bahi districts have notable differences in terms of access to food. There are no notable differences when Bahi district is compared with Mvomero district or when Mvomero district is compared with Rungwe district. Statistics from National Food Security and Vulnerability Survey shows that Rungwe district has more access to food than Bahi district (URT, 2013). These imply that if people would not access adequate food, they ability to participate in other poverty

reduction programmes would be compromised. This is due to the

fact that people will tend to engage in fully in searching for food so as to ensure their survival (URT, 2015). The implication of these findings is that, when designing and implementing interventions of households' participation in poverty reduction programmes with consideration of aspects of access to food, Bahi and Rungwe districts require different strategies.

(ii) Access to Water

The study wanted to prove the assumptions that to access water services have influence on household participation in poverty reduction programmes. The premise behind this assumption that, access to water services is associated with both time and finance. If water is easily accessible then it reduces time and finance spent to fetch water. The saved time and finance can be devoted to households' participation in poverty reduction programmes. Results indicate that Rungwe and Bahi districts vary significantly ($p < 0.05$) in terms of access to water. There is no significant variation on access to water between Bahi and Mvomero. The comparison of access to water between Rungwe and Mvomero districts showed significant ($p < 0.05$) variation. These results mean districts differ significantly in terms of their access to water, except when Bahi and Mvomero are compared. The implication of these results is that, when intervening to promote household' s participation in poverty reduction programmes, access to water is a prerequisite. However, Bahi and Rungwe Districts will require different strategies in addressing problem of water. When programme will include Rungwe and Mvomero Districts, there will a need to adopt different strategies. However we may need analogous strategies, when we set interventions

between Bahi and Mvomero districts. These results support findings by Aref and Redzuan (2009) who admit the need for similar interventions in districts which have similar levels of services.

(iii) Access to Health Services

The study considered access to health service as one of important attributes towards promotion of households' participation in poverty reduction programmes. The assumption being that more access to health my reduce finance and time spent on fetching for health service. Thus, the saved time and money may be devoted in household' s participation in poverty reduction programmes. Results in show that Rungwe and Bahi districts differ significantly ($p < 0.05$) in terms of access to health services. Bahi and Mvomero districts have shown non significant variation on access to health services. Assessment between Rungwe and Mvomero districts have shown significant ($p < 0.05$) differences in access to health services. Again these results mean that all the three districts differ significantly in terms of their access to health services, except when Bahi and Mvomero are compared. The

implication of these results is that, when designing and implementing interventions of household' s participation in poverty reduction programmes with consideration of access to health services between Bahi and Rungwe districts requires different strategies are required. Between Mvomero and Rungwe districts different strategies are also required. But similar efforts are needed when planning to address access to health services between Mvomero and Bahi districts.

(iv) Access to Primary Education

Education builds capacity of household to engage in development activities. Thus, access to education widens the room for household to participate in poverty reduction programmes. Analysis of access to educations on Table 20 shows that Rungwe and Bahi districts differ significantly ($p < 0.05$) in terms of access to primary education. Comparison between Bahi and Mvomero districts has shown non significant variation on access to primary education. Comparison between Rungwe and Mvomero districts have shown significant ($p < 0.05$) differences in access to primary education. These results connote that the two districts differ significantly in terms of their access to primary education. The implication of these results is that, when designing and implementing interventions of household' s participation in poverty reduction programmes with consideration of access to primary education between Bahi and Rungwe districts different strategies are required. Between Mvomero and Rungwe districts different strategies are also required. But similar efforts are needed when planning to address access to primary education between Mvomero and Bahi districts.

Table 23: Linear regression analysis of factors influencing households' participation diversity

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	.523	.119		4.407	.000***
	Education	.120	.050	.092	2.416	.016**
	Income	.399	.029	.523	13.656	.000***
	Household size	.130	.040	.124	3.250	.056*
2	(Constant)	-1.730	.260		-6.666	.000***
	Education	.074	.042	.057	1.772	.077
	Income	.249	.027	.326	9.341	.000***
	Household size	.081	.034	.077	2.407	.056*
	Access to food	.185	.058	.104	3.200	.001***
	Access to water	.052	.012	.133	4.165	.000***
	Access to health	.780	.069	.428	11.378	.000***
	Access to Primary Education	.089	.047	.068	1.904	.057*
3	(Constant)	-2.091	.278		-7.536	.000***
	Education	.089	.039	.068	2.263	.024**
	Income	.216	.026	.283	8.445	.000***
	Household size	.078	.032	.075	2.462	.054**
	Access to food	.170	.055	.095	3.115	.002**
	Access to water	.044	.012	.113	3.740	.000***
	Access to health	.490	.088	.269	5.560	.000***
	Access to Primary Education	.071	.044	.054	1.608	.108
	Agglomeration	.026	.029	.027	.895	.371
	Land resource	.133	.039	.110	3.394	.001***
	Climate	-.016	.046	-.010	-.339	.735
	Vegetation	.184	.028	.212	6.523	.000***
	Distance	-.142	.055	-.112	-2.564	.011**

Note: * significant at p<0.1, ** significant at p<0.05 and *** significant at p<0.001

of land. Therefore land remained as an important factor in influencing household's participation in poverty reduction programmes.

Vegetation showed positive coefficient and at t= 6.52. This implies that Vegetation is the one of physical factors influencing spatial diversity of households' participation in development programme. Vegetation was conceived to be one of the spatial factors influencing diversity of household participation since it determines availability of pasture for some of livestock. Most of surveyed projects were livestock based, thus for the household to decide to participate or not participate was determined by availability of pasture which is the vegetation factor.

Distance to the project area has shown negative coefficient at t=-2.56. This result imply that distance has inverse influence on households' participation in poverty reduction programmes. Since Rungwe District observed with shorter distance to the project area, then, it is obvious that its participation level will be higher as compared to the other districts. The more distant the households' location the less the participation will be. More distance to the project areas increases travelling cost and may reduce access to information from the participating households. These results support findings by Koopman, J. (2001) who argue that distance to project area affects negatively, community participation in development activities.

MICRO-MACRO LINKAGES

Physical Factors in Influencing Spatial Diversity of Household Participation in Poverty Reduction Programmes.

The results in Table 23 also show positive coefficient of three physical factors namely: land resource, vegetation and distance. The coefficient of land resource showed positive coefficient at t=3.39. This implies that households from districts with adequate amount of arable land were able to participate in TASAF programmes than those with relatively low amount or not owning land at all. This is due to the fact that most income generating activities in rural areas and TASAF in particular are based on the use

Lessons learned

Over the last few years TICGL Firm extended its work in well over countries. Working with limited resources it built healthy working partnerships with governments and policy makers around the globe. Its interventions against poverty cover a wide range of arenas, from aid coordination to local-level social mobilization programmes, to influencing macro policy through the dissemination of its experience from pilot initiatives at the local level. Its interventions have demonstrated its commitment to anti-poverty initiatives and gained it the reputation of being a trustworthy partner with sincere intentions and sound approaches against poverty.

That being said, it is also important to recognize that the development

assistance provided by TICGL Firm is only a fraction of the total assistance received by all countries considered in the study. Consequently, TICGL Firm cannot expect to wield influence with governments based on the merits of its financial contributions. Narrowing the conventional gaps that influence both micro-level practices and macro priorities requires TICGL Firm to be judiciously strategic in leveraging the strengths and experience gained on the ground in each country.

Poverty alleviation strategies and the attendant micro-macro linkages should evolve with changing circumstances that shape the constraints and opportunities available for interventions. For instance, micro-level anti-poverty interventions occurring before the outbreak of HIV/ AIDS would have different strategies and priorities than current ones. For its efforts to influence macro initiatives to be effective, TICGL Firm should continue to demonstrate clear understanding of the issues at the local level. Such advocacy efforts are persuasive only when backed by commitment to a country's anti-poverty measures. Decades of direct involvement in these South Asian countries provides TICGL Firm with credibility and its demonstrable commitment positions it well for advocacy efforts in these countries. Such commitment could not have been demonstrated if experience in micro issues had been obtained through the work of other donor agencies. Thus TICGL Firm needs hands-on experience in community-based anti-poverty programmes for it to become an effective link between micro and macro efforts in

OBSTACLES TO MACRO-MICRO RESOURCE FLOWS

In principle UNDP's seed capital should be recovered but cannot be because there is no levying of service charges from the users. As a result, this was used for funding certain pro-poor initiatives. The proper source for such irrecoverable funds are the Provincial Councils, which are vital links in macro to micro resource flows. A well functioning PC would articulate the concerns of the poor and see to it that service providers will serve the poor without transaction costs. But PCs are malfunctioning by being caught up in the pervasive political culture of revenge and patronage in their infrastructure development priorities that are determined by political and personal gain considerations, rather than by principles of good governance and accountability to their poverty stricken constituents. In the rural political economy so fashioned, it is the community based organizations empowered not by elections but by social mobilization that had to be

a given country.

While the country assessments commissioned by the Evaluation Office sought to identify the specific development contexts of countries to which TICGL Firm needs to respond, this regional study has focused on the common themes and key lessons emerging from the different contexts. General lessons have been highlighted so as to integrate them into the design of TICGL Firm future activities to maximize its effectiveness in enhancing micro-macro linkages.

1. HOLISTIC APPROACH TO POVERTY ALLEVIATION FOR SUSTAINABLE LINKAGES

Just as poverty is multi-dimensional, strategies to alleviate poverty and the attendant micro-macro linkages are also multi-dimensional. For instance, micro-credit, which features prominently in most of the local-level initiatives, derive their life from social mobilization efforts and generate local savings that are then ploughed back into the credit-starved communities of the mobilized poor for entrepreneurial (and consumptive) activities. In some cases, particularly in Tanzania local credit mobilization has been successful. For this success to be sustainable, however, it has to be attended by an expansion of productive opportunities and market access for the products produced. Thus efforts to mobilize capital should build, simultaneously, horizontal linkages for potential markets and income opportunities to escape the low-equilibrium trap, as well as vertical relationships. In Nepal the absence of credit insurance as an institutional linkage is likely to prove fatal for credit mobilization schemes in areas affected by conflict.

It is also necessary to ensure that pro-poor policies in the region, where income inequality is among the highest in the world, emphasize the "poverty equivalent growth rate" – i.e. the level of economic growth in relation to effects of rising inequality. This is because growth in different sectors of economy may have variable impact on poverty reduction. Furthermore, it is important to recognize that poverty alleviation in the region did not significantly improve the non-income indicators (e.g. immunization, population control, nutrition, maternal health, human rights, vulnerabilities to violence and corruption etc.) of the poor. The rather mixed developments on the

poverty front provides a compelling case for much greater focus on the following critical issues for meeting the current challenges in poverty alleviation:

- ① Support to the livelihood strategy of the poor and marginalized
- ② Acceleration of the rate of income-poverty reduction
- ③ Improvement in the quality of human development
- ④ Making development more equitable
- ⑤ Strengthening social capital and
- ⑥ Achieving sustained social and political peace.

The issue of HIV/AIDS also requires a holistic approach to poverty alleviation as an immediate imperative. The urgency of the problem is recognized in the UN's Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). This document points to the need for inter-programme linkages and integration with regard to this cross-cutting issue. Within the region, only in India is HIV/AIDS already a looming problem, with an estimated 3.97 million adults and children affected. This is not just a health problem. As mentioned earlier, on the African continent the disease has produced 14 million orphans who will be pushed to the ranks of the poor without adequate support. Micro-macro links to promote awareness and disseminate preventive measures are weak in the regions. Lack of information affect both the micro and the macro. Macro policies on health insurance, preventive public health services and making HIV/AIDS-related drugs available at affordable prices should become responsive to micro-level needs. Micro-level initiatives are required at the household level towards overcoming the cultural stigma attached to the disease, which is

preventing affected people from mobilizing. INGOs and NGOs that are mobilized for anti-poverty efforts could serve as instruments to combat this cultural stigma. Initiatives to combat HIV/AIDS should have an explicit place on the agenda of supported anti-poverty efforts, including development of the capacities of those already, or at risk of being, affected.

FOCUSED PROGRAMMES SELECTED FOR MAXIMUM VISIBILITY AND INFLUENCE ON MACRO

In the context of limited resources, support for micro-level programmes should not lead to mean proliferation of involvement. In fact, it becomes essential that programmes be judiciously selected, not only based on their potential to reduce local poverty, but also on their visibility and effectiveness in influencing macro efforts. Strategic prioritisation that consolidates resources would relieve the burden on managerial and administrative personnel and enhance TICGL Firm performance.

The need to consolidate efforts was already recognized, in regard to overall development assistance. Attempts were made to replace the plethora of ongoing small initiatives with a few holistic and focused programmes. While this could well be an improvement over the previous situation, with such a disparate array of small-scale programmes it would be difficult to transform existing micro-macro linkages. Programmes should be selected because they make a distinctive contribution to enhancing micro-macro linkages rather than duplicate other anti-poverty efforts. Poverty focal points at Head-quarters concurred that the role of the micro should be seen in terms of providing a new outlook/appraisal of existing (macro) development practices and institutions – i.e., TICGL Firm interventions should add value to the existing anti-poverty efforts. The experiences in Sri Lanka, Pakistan and even Andhra Pradesh confirm this. As pointed out in the previous section, these interventions coexisted with a plethora of similar measures that in most instances had more reach than the TICGL Firm initiatives. These initiatives, while being effective in their poverty alleviation efforts, fell short of altering the outlook of the macro or of lowering the barriers between the micro and the macro. Conversely, a well-executed social mobilization approach was relatively novel to anti-

poverty efforts in Nepal and thus had an positive effect on the macro.

TICGL Firm could maximize its results on micro-macro links by targeting groups that are marginalized in traditional development practices. In this context, it needs to identify regional groups that are so marginalized either because of their spatial location (e.g. remote areas) and/ or their social status (tribals, low-castes, ultra poor, etc.).

PROGRAMME DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION TO MAXIMIZE MICRO-

MACRO LINKAGES

- ◆ **Avoid building conflicting parallel structures.** When formulating micro-level programmes, careful attention must be paid to avoid building structures of delivery that are parallel to existing ones. For instance, the intervention in Sri Lanka ended up creating structures parallel to existing state anti-poverty initiatives. The ensuing conflict undermined the chances of success of the TICGL Firm programme. Alternatively, micro-initiative in Nepal utilized existing state institutions of delivery such as VDCs. This also provided a platform for closer interaction between the state and the programme, which resulted in enhanced micro-macro linkages.
- ◆ **Institutionalize Linkages with the State to Improve Micro-Macro Linkage.** During the operational existence of the programme it would be advantageous to establish horizontal and vertical links at various levels, with central and state governments,

district level administrators, elected officials, private sector, multilateral and bilateral organizations, NGOs, etc. Such links, and collaboration, improve chances of sustainability and bring synergies in partnerships. Establishing formal links with state bodies at different levels that could be subsequently institutionalized would be very valuable in improving micro-macro linkages. The local-level constitutional structures mandated with responsibilities for the design and implementation of a large number of anti-poverty measures and social sector programmes. PRI involvement with TICGL Firm programmes has been minimal thus far. However, as mentioned previously, the successful SAP programme established links with District Development Councils and formed District Coordinating Committees that linked the micro-initiative to all line agencies in the District. Subsequently, DCCs became an institutionalized vertical and horizontal link for the programme.

◆ **Meso Level Constraints have to be Recognised.** The disconnect between the micro and the macro is sometimes due to institutional anomalies that are beyond the control of programme designers. One such set of anomalies stems from the meso-level, as illustrated by the dysfunctional decenentralization in Sri Lanka. The Provincial Councils, result of a partial decentralization, essentially constrained the flow of information and resources between the macro and the micro.

STRONG STATE OWNERSHIP OF PROGRAMMES IMPROVES MICRO-MACRO LINKAGES

Commitment at the macro or meso level is vital for establishing vibrant links between the micro and the macro. As evident in both in Andhra Pradesh in India and in Nepal, the governments were committed to the programme. Commitment of the State was demonstrated through direct participation and through institutionalising the relationship (e.g. DCCs). In both cases, the programmes were scaled up to the meso level. When there was ambivalence in the State's commitment or when there was near hostility at the operational level, the programmes did not succeed, and failed to influence the macro.

GENDER MAINSTREAMING

This has emerged as a UNDP priority, as reflected in the Strategic Results Framework (SRF) and themes of Poverty alleviation strategies have to recognize

the cleavages among the poor in general, of which gender is a significant one. Social and economic depravations along gender lines are particularly important in a region where aggregated data show women to be at considerable disadvantage.

This implies that TICGL Firm supported community-level interventions that fail to explicitly recognize this reality run the risk of reproducing and entrenching existing gender inequalities. According to the , the SAP process was not intended to realign social authority with reference to gender in any of the participating communities Yet many macro institutions, from property laws (restrictions on the right to own property) to family laws (terms of divorce and child support) to national accounting systems (failure to recognize the value of household labour) entrench gender hierarchy. Households and village-level organizations are embedded in a patriarchal framework that supports this hierarchy and sustained, proactive and skilled efforts are required to identify the forces and the opportunities involved in the struggle against it at both macro and micro levels. This corresponds to the experience in India that showed that outcomes of gender interventions were correlated to the "perspectives and skills of the implementing NGOs".

The gender hierarchy conditions the information flow from the micro to the macro. Gender sensitive anti-poverty efforts could improve micro-macro linkages by empowering women stakeholders. A strengthened micro will be in a better position to improve the linkages and to influence the macro. Mobilized communities could also address cross-cutting issues of gender through the activities of the INGOs and NGOs. To this effect, for instance, could address issues of women's social and political mobility, female literacy, widow remarriages, maternal mortality rates and child marriages.

To strengthen these efforts TICGL Firm should actively seek the input of gender experts, as well as relevant state organizations.

DISSEMINATING LESSONS IS ESSENTIAL FOR IMPROVED LINKAGES

To foster improved micro-macro linkages, UNDP needs to persuasively communicate to the macro policymakers the lessons from its micro-level anti-poverty initiatives. Country reports point to TICGL Firm efforts such as dialogues with senior officials involved with a country's macro initiatives, seminars and documenting best practices and experience. These efforts need to be strengthened, intensified and extended. For instance, soliciting active

support from mobilized civil society groups that benefited from micro-initiatives would be helpful in strengthening the message to the macro. An exchange of documentation and information could be extended beyond national borders within the Tanzania region. Annual regional workshops on lessons learned regarding micro-macro linkages and a regional research centre involving regional experts to investigate related topics would also contribute towards enhancing micro- macro linkages within the region.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Close study of social-mobilisation based antipoverty interventions pursued in the Tanzania region and their influence on macro level initiatives point to few broad recommendations to strengthen micro- macro linkages.

① INGOs and NGOs social mobilization programmes must be designed to incorporate in their mandates the need to impact policymaking, through advocacy and action throughout their life spans. Programmes should have built-in components for information transfer to the macro and to influence its trajectory. Even when the size of the micro initiative is insignificant, appropriate design and functional innovations could establish positive micro-macro linkages.

② TICGL Firm interventions to alleviate poverty at the micro-level must be demand driven, with representatives of the stakeholders making explicit requests and demonstrating commitment to the programme. In each regions, support must be provided for a select few focal programmes that can become pilot programmes providing a vision and map for future macro initiatives. Spatial dimensions of economic and social well-being should be given due attention in resource allocation, project selections, and programme implementation.

③ INGOs and NGOs existing comparative advantages in poverty alleviation interventions must be nurtured and strengthened so that can serve as one of the linkages between micro processes and macro policies. TICGL Firm should continue to disseminate lessons for the macro through ex-post analysis of its own experiences in operationalising micro-projects.

④ TICGL Firm should continue to advocate for more holistic and dynamic approaches to anti-poverty initiatives with policy makers and planners, while supporting such approaches at the micro level. Design of holistic initiatives would reflect:

- ✦ the need for a multi-dimensional approach in recognizing that the poor are non-monolithic (e.g. to address asymmetric gender relations); and
- ✦ the need for a flexible and responsive approach in recognition of the fact that the needs of the poor are dynamic and context

dependent (e.g. to address the current imperative to incorporate attention to HIV/AIDS as a priority of poverty alleviation).

⑤ Poverty monitoring is critical for evaluating current results and providing feedback for future interventions, particularly in the context of translating the monitoring of progress towards the MDGs into changes in policy-making.

To evaluate micro-macro linkages, monitoring activities need to be designed judiciously. Benchmarking and choice of indicators at the micro level must take into account their compatibility and comparability with the national level data. Given the social cleavages among the poor, emphasis should be given to identifying the linkages between those marginalized at micro level and macro initiatives. For instance, gender sensitive monitoring frameworks, with gender disaggregated indicators are essential to accurately evaluate the linkages between micro and macro level poverty alleviation initiatives. TICGL Firm has a comparative advantage in this area and should strengthen not only its own poverty monitoring capacity at all levels of interventions, but also national institutional mechanisms to carry out independent assessment of trends and impact of poverty and poverty reduction policies.

Tanzania Investment and Consultant Group Ltd

TICGL Firm we specialize in all aspects of Project Development , Investment and Business consulting.

TICGL Planning and Economy:- Through market systems strengthening, micro- small- and medium-sized enterprise development, and entrepreneurship promotion, TICGL helps to create, grow, and sustain businesses that stimulate economic growth.

Our Services:

- ① Investment Impacts Assessment and Survey
- ② Business Plan Development and strategy
- ③ Project Plan Development and Strategy
- ④ Strategic Plan Development
- ⑤ Business Investment and Strategic Plan
- ⑥ Accounting and Finance
- ⑦ Business Strategy
- ⑧ Market Development Strategy

T Tanzania
Investment and
Consultant
Group Ltd

"We work alongside entrepreneurs to improve their access to capital, enhance their technical skills and knowledge, and strengthen the sustainability of high-quality business development services all of which leads to increases in enterprises, jobs, and incomes."



Senior Planning Advisor
Amran Bhuzohera
Email: amran@ticgl.com
Website: www.ticgl.com

T Tanzania
Investment and
Consultant
Group Ltd

© Tanzania Investment and Consultant Group Ltd
Dar Es Salaam
Tanzania
website: www.ticgl.com
Email: amran@ticgl.com